

### **Coronavirus COVID-19: Perspectives for school systems**

This Document is Current only as of April 24, 2020

This Document is Solely Intended to Provide Insights and Best Practices for the Client – This Document does not Constitute Client Advice

CONFIDENTIAL AND PROPRIETARY Any use of this material without specific permission of McKinsey & Company is strictly prohibited



#### COVID-19 is, first and foremost, a global humanitarian challenge

Thousands of health professionals are heroically battling the virus, putting their own lives at risk. Governments and industry are working together to understand and address the challenge, support victims and their families and communities, and search for treatments and a vaccine.

#### The spread of the virus has led to school system closures around the world

The global spread of COVID-19 is accelerating, with half a million confirmed cases in 199 countries and territories. In response, over 165 countries have closed schools country-wide leaving over 1.5 billion children out of school

### School systems face uncertainty as to how long this will last and when schools can reopen

While recognizing the uncertainties inherent in discussing any timeline for returning to pre-outbreak normalcy, this document strives to lay out key considerations towards reopening K-12 schools once the outbreak starts to subside. In doing so, it focuses on two main questions

- When can the schools be re-opened and what approach could be followed to reach the decision?
- How can the K-12 stakeholders facilitate and operationalize school reopening with a primary focus on health and safety measures?



### Countries are at different stages when it comes to deciding whether schools should be closed / opened

Non-exhaustive list of examples



# Most of the states in the US are closed for the academic year and are planning for reopening in Fall 2020 if situation improves



# Education system response to the pandemic could be approached along 5 key steps



Nerve center

Managing across the 5Rs requires a new architecture to plan, coordinate, manage stakeholders and external partnerships

### School systems have to address four priorities across these steps. The focus of this deck is the return phase

		Resolve	Resilience	Return	Reimagine	Reform
	Maintain health and safety of students, staff & the community	School closures and physical distancing Nutrition / school meals Vulnerable student diagnostic and response Special needs support Remote mental health support		School reopening health & safety plan and protocols Mental health support	School healthcare infrastructure and resilience Partnerships for enhanced healthcare at school	
	Maximize student learning and thriving	Parent communication and activation Device / internet distribution Robust remote learning Grading and assessment Incoming and graduating class transitions		Remediation strategies for lost learning Robust blended learning	Progress to SDG #4 Learning innovations to be sustained	
$\sum$	Support teachers and staff to adapt to the new reality	Teacher training, support, and collaboration Redeploying unutilized staff Sick leave policies		Teacher re-integration NGOs, volunteers partnerships for support Professional development	Teacher innovations to be sustained	
	Ensure a strong operational and financial future	Data privacy and online safe Vendor communications Scenario planning and finan Remote administrative infras	ty cial stress testing structure	Reopening operations Budget strategy and reallocation	Budgets for new econo Policy changes for the	omic reality new normal

### **Re-opening schools important** for societal continuity...

### **Benefits**

- Allows pupils to resume their learning and development from qualified teachers and together with peers
- Beyond formal learning, re-activate the socialization function of schools (i.e. teaching basic rules of living together)
- Enables parents to return to work and reopen the economy by extension
- Safeguards support for vulnerable children that lack access to nutritious meals, safe environment, academic support, or effective/ affordable remote learning
- Put an end to the negative psycho-affective effects that result from the social isolation imposed by confinement measures

# ...but risks need to be duly considered and mitigated

### Risks

- Health of pupils, their families and teachers could be at risk if the pandemic is still not completely under control
- The regional / national transmission rate might increase as a result of the relaxation of strict confinement measures for both children and teachers<sup>1</sup>
- Parents may not send children to school yet and teachers may not yet come to work, if they do not feel it is safe to do so, causing a wedge among pupils, classes (teachers) and workers (parents)
- Premature reopening may leave schools ill-equipped to provide essential services, leading to more disruption among children

<sup>1.</sup> Depending in part on the ability to deploy and constantly apply protective measures (e.g., social distancing) at school

# There are three main elements to consider when considering school re-opening



(A) When do	you reopen and for whom?	<b>B</b> How do you get ready to reopen?
When to reopen?	<ul> <li>Trade-offs would have to be weighed in on following parameters:         <ul> <li>Public health risks: Impact of school reopening on virus transmission</li> <li>Economic activity: Dependency on childcare for parents to return to work</li> <li>Impact on students learning and thriving</li> <li>Ability to safeguard school systems with health and safety protocols</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Health & Safety 1 Resurgence preparation & planning Health & Safety Reopening schools 2 Re- enrollment
For whom do you reopen?	<ul> <li>Contextual information will define different approaches:</li> <li>— Regional context</li> <li>— Student demographics</li> </ul>	3 Remediation
	What kind of structures do you put in place	e to monitor and streamline the process?

What kind of structures do you put in place to monitor and streamline the process? (e.g. Team structure, governance, tools, communications strategy)

#### Current as of April 22, 2020

### • Deciding on reopening requires weighing public health risks against economic activity, student impact and ability to safeguard

Extent and weight of risks will vary across countries and regions

Not Exhaustive

Factors	Key questions	
Public health risks	To what extent can the health of students, families, staff and the general population be safeguarded while opening schools?	Considering the inputs of 3 key stakeholders
Criticality for economic activity	To what extent does school closure contribute to GDP loss and unemployment by preventing reopening the economy?	- Teachers - Students
Impact on student learning & thriving	To what extent is student learning falling behind when schools are closed? To what extent are inequities exacerbated during school closures?	
Ability to safeguard schools	To what extent are school systems ready to reopen with the right health & safety measures in place?	

# A There is a continuum of approaches and timelines to reopen schools across different countries

**Preliminary insights** 

### Schools among the first of sectors to open

Schools reopening considered critical to continue student learning and reopening economy and precedes all or most other sectors on reopening Schools could reopen in parallel with other sectors; most countries following a phased approach to gradually bring selected student groups back on campus (e.g. vulnerable students, students in lowrisk areas, younger students and high school students, children of "essential workers") Schools among the last of sectors to open

Schools reopening considered too risky for controlling transmission and not core to reopening economy; schools opened only after most/all of non-essential sectors



Japan and China have reopened most schools in low-risk areas<sup>1</sup> (after more than a month of closure)



**Denmark** and **Norway** are reopening kindergarten (and primary schools) ahead of other sectors (after ~3 weeks of closure)



German regions might reopen schools on May 4, initially for students in their final years of primary or secondary school (after ~5 weeks of closure)



France and Switzerland will gradually reopen starting with kindergarten and primary schools followed by secondary schools, on May 11 (after ~6-8 weeks of closure)



Spain, Italy and Greece might not reopen schools before the start of the school year in September. Other sectors of the economy will be (partially) reopened before



**Colorado, Florida** and **Texas** are not expected to reopen schools for the rest of the academic year whereas they have reopened hair salons, beaches and retail stores respectively

10

1. Japan and China are opening schools on a rolling basis – in low risk areas schools are reopened with safety protocols in place but they remain closed in high risk areas in Tokyo and Wuhan

Source: Press search - e.g., The Guardian, "Merkel announces plans to reopen schools and shops in Germany", April 15, 2020; USA Today, "US reopening: What states are relaxing social distancing restrictions and moving away from lockdowns?", April 22, 2020; Le Monde, "Comment le gouvernement envisage la réouverture des écoles : un étalement sur trois semaines, des classes de 15 élèves et un « protocole sanitaire », April 21, 2020; Washington Post, « In glimpse of life after lockdown, some countries begin to reopen schools", April 18, 2020; Financial Times, « Denmark plans to reopen primary schools", April 6, 2020.

# A School systems will need to gauge the risks and identify trade-offs to determine the approach for school reopening

Not Exhaustive and Preliminary insights				
	Schools among the first of sectors to open		Schools among the last of sectors to open	
	What do you have to believe to make a deci	sion for school reopening?		
Public health risk	Risks for children and teachers themselves as well as for asymptomatic transmission through children considered limited	Risks for children themselves considered moderate; reopening schools still seen as a risk due to likelihood of asymptomatic transmissions	Reopening of the schools can pose a significant risk to both children and others	
Criticality for economic activity	Schools are a critical prerequisite to allowing parents to return to work; significant portion of workers rely on childcare	Economic activity can return through slow, systematic / staged reopening of schools	Most parents can continue to work from home or most households can arrange for caregivers (including through government- provided care)	
Impact on student learning and thriving	Significant learning loss with remote learning especially for vulnerable students Broader risks to students in staying home (nutrition, domestic violence)	Blended learning works for some subjects and grade levels; in-person lessons required for others	Remote learning allows students to continue learning at acceptable levels	
Ability to safeguard schools	Health & Safety measures can adequately mitigate the risk of infection in schools	Health & Safety measures are insufficient to prevent the spread of the disease if schools return to full capacity	Very difficult to safeguard schools given inherent characteristics of children, plus shortages of supplies and budgets	

# A Schools reopening is critical for economic activity as ~16% of US workforce (~26M) is dependent on childcare



### A COVID-19 Education Reopening Readiness Dashboard

Illustrative		Score	Domain porformanco motrico	
Public health risk	Foundational public health	23	Protective equipment (e.g., masks, gloves) availability Testing capability Tracking and tracing capability	New active cases Share of hospitalized patients Mortality rate
	Health system capacity	54	Protective equipment (e.g., masks, gloves) availability Regular beds availability Intensive care beds availability	Clinical workforce (e.g., doctors, nurses) availability Treatment availability Ability to scale up healthcare capacity and PPE
Criticality for economic activity	Economic health	32	Number of workers dependent upon childcare School substitutes (e.g., older children) availability Share of GDP generated by workers dependent upon childcare <sup>2</sup>	Share of consumer spending generated by workers dependent upon childcare Bankruptcies risk for companies employing workers dependent upon childcare
Impact on student learning and thriving	Remote learning effectiveness	15	Device and Internet availability Remote learning attendance Target curriculum coverage / learning pace	Online assessment results Online tutoring availability Parents, teachers and students satisfaction
	Impact on equity	25	Performance gap per student pre- and during quarantine Performance gap across students during quarantine Cases of domestic violence and child abuse	Access gap between different socio-economic groups
Ability to safeguard	School safeguarding	76	PPE available per school employee and student Compliance with physical distancing and sanitation rules Compliance with health checks	

# As governments attempt to slow the spread of virus, school systems could identify the stage and readiness for their regions

An illustration of four readiness stages for a regional school system



1. There is mixed research on whether keeping students at home helps reduce transmission significantly (e.g. see details below for two different researches)

Source: Russell M Viner et al. "School closure and management practices during coronavirus outbreaks including COVID-19: a rapid systematic review", The Lancet, April 6, 2020; Ferguson, N., et al. Strategies for mitigating an influenza pandemic. Nature 442, 448–452 (2006).

#### Key reopening stages

- At A, the stage 4 health system likely requires school closures to comply with social distancing guidelines<sup>1</sup> and lockdown measures<sup>1</sup>
- Moving from A to B may require systems to prepare policies and infrastructure to put in place during stages 3 and 2 once the epidemic situation allows reopening
- Moving from B to C as the virus is brought under control may require careful planning to ensure the agility to swiftly move ahead to D, or back to A if virus spread soars after reopening
- Moving from C to D would likely require protocols and capacity expansion to open all schools under the next normal, being mindful of possible virus resurgence
- To move to D / reopening, cases reported should have declined steadily for the last two weeks; local healthcare providers should have ability to provide testing, treatment, and isolation for all seeking care, or coordinated local mobile surge capacity

### A Example – What a potential path could look like

Illustrative

	Stage 4 (all schools closed)	Stage 3	Stage 2	Stage 1 (all schools open)
School closure type and instruction delivery	<ul> <li>All school types likely closed except (potentially) for certain narrow segments (e.g. children of critical workers)</li> <li>Remote learning more likely to be provided based on local guidelines</li> <li>Policies around assessments and grades to be defined</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Primary schools may reopen</li> <li>Secondary schools likely closed</li> <li>Blended learning could be provided, large portion of curriculum taught through remote learning</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Both primary and secondary schools could be open</li> <li>Blended learning to be provided, majority of the delivery could potentially be conducted in person</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>All schools open</li> <li>Learning resumes in the classrooms</li> <li>Best practices to be retained from remote learning phase</li> </ul>
Activities conducted	<ul> <li>Strict closure could potentially reduce spread</li> <li>No activities may be conducted in school except transition to remote learning</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Potentially reduced school days</li> <li>Possible focus on core-curriculum classes (e.g., no gym, arts class)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Full school days</li> <li>Limited extra-curricular activities may be allowed</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Full school days</li> <li>Educational activities return to normal</li> <li>Based on national protocols, events to be conducted e.g. graduation, field trips</li> </ul>
Safety & Health	<ul> <li>Social distancing and lockdown measures set by government</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Strict safety protocols likely to be implemented</li> <li>Policies for staff, teachers and infrastructure to be put in place</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>There might be a switch to less strict safety protocols</li> <li>Dynamic plan likely to be required to have the agility for closedown if virus resurges</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Basic hygiene and health and safety protocols to be implemented</li> </ul>

# A While considering for whom do you reopen, four archetypes can be identified based on global examples Opening Partial opening

2. Targeted groups

Higher

Secondary

Primary

Pre-primarv



### Archetype 1. No reopening



**Rationale** Considerable pressure on health care system and risks of resurgence calls for schools to remain closed till the end of school year (July)

#### Examples<sup>1</sup>



#### Schools to open or remain open for specific segments that are disproportionately impacted by school closures (e.g. special education schools, vulnerable population)

Specific segments



### 3. Targeted levels



Schools to open as a means to provide childcare for parents, enabling them to go back to work and open other sectors

Denmark	Norway

#### 4. Targeted years



Prioritized opening for students in grades that have high stake exams to allow progression to next level

Germany	Portugal	Fran	ice

1. Examples based on public reports, and includes likely scenarios announced in the press

# Once reopening decision is made, readiness depends on four key elements; health & safety becomes a pre-requisite

Deep-dive

Resurgence

planning

**Preliminary insights** 

Health & Safety

Key safeguards to be put in place with respect to following categories:

- Physical infrastructure
- Transportation and food service
- Scheduling and staffing
- Health and behavioral norms

Critical to re-enroll students back to school especially those who are at a **higher risk of dropping out** and the ones who have not kept in touch with teachers during the lockdown

**Re-enrollment** 

Planning required to fill academic and nonacademic gaps created during school closure leading to loss of learning or other socio-emotional disadvantages

Remediation

Advanced preparation for schools to be able to continue education for students **in case second wave of virus resurges**; readiness for blended learning for all students

# <sup>B1</sup> In deciding which health and safety measures to implement schools are facing difficult trade-offs between effectiveness and feasibility



# <sup>B1</sup> Illustration of example measures that schools in countries are taking to ensure health and safety (1/3)

#### Non-exhaustive

Physical	Changes to ensure physical distancing	Establish controlled entrances and exits (e.g. based on grade levels, students and teacher entry) and flows (e.g. one-way traffic in tight corridors) Restrict access to places that allow larger gatherings (e.g. cafeteria, staff rooms, libraries) or close these entirely Grid off sections for common spaces and lunch areas to help students separate and reduce seating to ensure >6ft physical distance Separate partitions in open spaces with high risk of interaction/ contact (e.g. playground, blacktop) Add plastic barriers and guards between desks (students and teachers)
infrastructure	Changes to enable health and sanitization protocols	Install no-touch bathroom fittings, no-touch trash cans Install hand-sanitizing stations at entrances, common areas in the school Discontinue vending machines
	Changes to create healthy buildings	Improve building conditions and airflow (e.g., ventilation per OSHA guidance)
Transportation	Changes to transportation forms, routes, and sanitization procedures	Increase number of bus routes to reduce occupancy on each bus Change bus schedules to bring students in batches that align to cohorts (grade-level, floors) Sanitize school transportation after each use Subsidize parking/ sponsor carpools / create safe bike/walking routes to encourage use of private transport
anu toou service	Changes to food service to reduce cross- contamination	Ensure all food items and choices are fully boxed and no food can be directly touched by students; enforce 'take what you touch' Package cutlery, seasonings, sauces and napkins in single serve packages Stagger lunch times by class to ensure physical distancing; add markings on ground to prevent crowding

# <sup>B1</sup> Illustration of example measures that schools in countries are taking to ensure health and safety (2/3)

#### Non-exhaustive

	Scheduling adaptations that reduce number of students on campus at any time	Create staggered schedule for students to attend school on different days (alternating days) or different parts of the day (morning/ afternoon) Place fewer than 50% students in the classroom to allow physical distancing
Scheduling and staffing	Creation of cohorts to minimize number of people each student/teacher interacts with (e.g. by grade, by floor)	Create staggered schedule for cohorts to start/end at different times to avoid contact Develop learning schedule in cohorts to minimize contact with broader group of students (e.g. in primary reduce mixing for electives) Stagger recess, lunch hours to avoid contact between cohorts
	Avoidance of large groups and gatherings to reduce mixing	Cancel assemblies and other large gatherings
	Behavioral norms	Establish physical distancing (>6ft) protocol at all times (either just teachers, or teachers and students) Enforce wearing of masks (either just teachers, or teachers and students)
		Set up regular schedules for hand washing and sanitation
Health and behavioral		Enforce no sharing of supplies, lunches among students
norms	Training of staff, parents and students	Use promotional programs around hand washing and other best practices (e.g., "masks are cool" campaign) Set up trainings for current staff on health protocols
		Educate parents/ communities on school protocols and frequently share updated policies

# <sup>B1</sup> Illustration of example measures that schools in countries are taking to ensure health and safety (3/3)

#### Non-exhaustive

	Sick leave policies	Review attendance policy for students (ensuring students stay home in case of symptoms exhibited individually or for a family member) Set up sick leave and remote teaching policies for teachers to accommodate schedules of different grade levels
	Procedures on entering the school site	Establish controlled entrances and exits (e.g. based on grade levels, students and teacher entry) Check and log body temperature (with contactless thermometer, thermal camera) for all employees, visitors, and students Limit visiting hours from external members (incl. parents) Adjust protocols on receiving mail, deliveries, etc.
Health and behavioral norms	Enhanced cleaning and sanitization	Enhanced hygiene protocols on school ground with a focus on common touch points (e.g., doors, stairwell handles, light switch, elevator switch) Promote hand-washing multiple times a day (create schedule to avoid over-crowding for washing)
	Contact tracing, emergency and disease management	Notify health officials of suspected or confirmed positive cases Set up policies for closing classes, cohorts, or entire institution and for managing symptomatic students Set up protocols for contact tracing if cases are detected in school/ community Set up isolation facility to handle emergencies in case of cases detected on campus Partner with local communities, health institutions to be first point of contact during emergencies Schedule regular inspection in line with COVID-19 health protocols

### B1 Each system can aim towards comprehensive health safeguards, but may have to adapt to realities on the ground

Safe interactions Healthy school operations Healthy learning environment

Illustrative deep-dives on a few measures	Preliminary insights, outcomes are evolving as situation changes			
Best-practice health safeguards	Feasibility challenges	Potential compromises <sup>1</sup>		
Ensuring teachers and students stay 6 feet apart at all times	It will be immensely challenging to keep children – especially younger ones - physically apart from each other in a schooling	Accept that children will physically touch and double down on handwashing and other hygiene measures; enforce distancing between school staff		
	environment	Create cohorts of students that interact only with each other		
		Prioritize quick test and tracing with return to confinement of all class group in case of detected case		
Reordering school days to reduce the number of students present on-premises at any one time	Part-time programs will not completely solve the childcare issue nor allow optimal learning	Prioritize instruction or organize all day childcare for vulnerable children and children of back-to-work parent with no other non-working adult at home		
Requiring antibody tests for each teachers and staff as prerequisite to return	In the current situation, and for several months, the majority of teachers might not have yet been exposed to the virus	Protect older and immunocompromised teachers by asking them to stay at home and run remote learning; mandate other teachers return to school		
	Accuracy of serology test and degree / length of immunitization is currently unknown" <sup>2</sup>	Require that teachers and staff strictly follow preventive and diagnostic measures to limit risk of spread		
Conducting temperature checks with	There might not be contactless thermometers to conduct	Allow children to be tested at home or bring own device; stagger start times to enable standard		
school campus daily	Most children are asymptomatic	Prioritize quick test and tracing with return to confinement of all class group in case of detected case		
Enforcing no-touch bathrooms at all times	Installing "no-touch bathrooms" is a meaningful infrastructure	Increase frequency of bathroom sanitization		
	change and may not be feasible based upon contractor	Further invest in sanitizing stations		
		Have bathrooms shifts by class groups <sup>3</sup> with cleaning in between		
Enforcing personal protective equipment	It is unlikely that systems will be able to enforce mask use for	Ensure masks and gloves are available for teachers and staff		
(e.g., facemasks, gloves) at all times	younger children; even if enforcement was possible, availability of PPE may lag demand	Run campaigns to make mask wearing cool (Frozen II masks) but likely still hard to enforce		

School systems will have to constantly and rigorously assess time-cost tradeoffs and make decisions that will not cause acceptable threats to school populations health safety

1. NB: do not constitute recommendations

2. NB: On April 17, the head of WHO's emerging diseases and zoonosis unit warned that there was no evidence that antibody tests now being developed would show if a person has immunity or is no longer at risk of becoming re-infected by the Covid-19 virus.

NB: with exception in case of urgency.

# Once reopening decision is made, readiness depends on four key elements; health & safety becomes a pre-requisite

Deep-dive

Resurgence

planning

**Preliminary insights** 

Health & Safety

Key safeguards to be put in place with respect to following categories:

- Physical infrastructure
- Transportation and food service
- Scheduling and staffing
- Health and behavioral norms

Critical to re-enroll students back to school especially those who are at a **higher risk of dropping out** and the ones who have not kept in touch with teachers during the lockdown

**Re-enrollment** 

Planning required to fill academic and nonacademic gaps created during school closure leading to loss of learning or other socio-emotional disadvantages

Remediation

Advanced preparation for schools to be able to continue education for students **in case second wave of virus resurges**; readiness for blended learning for all students

### Re-enrollment needs tailored approach...

Schools may need to develop tailored approaches to address concerns of...

- Parents who are unwilling due to inadequacy of health & safety measures at schools or increased transmission risk
- Students who may need to go to workforce over education after the lockdown, in particular due to worsening of economic conditions
- Students who may choose to learn remotely over attendance at brick-and-mortar school
- Students who have dropped out or reduced engagement with their schools/teachers during remote learning
- Students who are traumatized by the virus outbreak experience and unwilling to go to school
- Students migrating to inaccessible areas
- Students demotivated due to falling behind their curriculum over the remote learning period

# ...and a process that includes and addresses concerns of all stakeholders

Details follow

#### Tracking and data

Identify key metrics / gaps and track key census data related to re-enrolment, including:

- Number of students whose families may have moved out / changed districts
- Number of students who/ whose families may need additional economic support to continue their education
- Number of students who did not have access to remote learning or fell behind their curriculum during the remote learning period

### Interventions and measures

Lay out a set of interventions to facilitate re-enrolment after the outbreak including measures on:

- Raising awareness
- Communications and tracking
- Economic support / stipends
- Community support
- Enforcing negative incentives
- Partnerships

### Policy and coordination

Develop a well-functioning implementation policy tailored to local conditions through:

- Stakeholder engagement and inputs from local communities on school needs
- Regular communication and coordination across local institutions on logistics and funding needs
- Increased private sector engagement

### **B2** Schools can take a number of measures to support re-enrollment

Lever	Potential measures	Example interventions from past incidents
Raising awareness	<ul> <li>Brochures on learning and precautions being taken schools to ensure students are not at risk</li> <li>Conduct introductory webinars for parents and virtual tours for students</li> </ul>	After the Ebola outbreak in DRC in 2018, UNICEF trained 7,200 teachers in measures of prevention against Ebola and
Offering community incentives	<ul> <li>Community outreach by schools through emails, text, phone calls to ensure parents understand the enrolment/re-enrolment process and dates</li> <li>Leverage community volunteer groups to help establish community-based social uplift</li> <li>Peer-to-peer network (buddy system) to keep students engaged</li> </ul>	dispatched handwashing points, soaps, and thermometers to affected schools; schools also received information on methods of transmission / prevention
Online pre-learning /	<ul> <li>Offer additional flexibility on enrolment deadlines; provide clear online enrolment guidance and support</li> <li>Offer online pre-enrolment learning options for incoming students (and personalized support)</li> </ul>	After Idai tropical cyclone, an NGO constructed two disaster-resilient schools in Sofala province with improved Wash (water, sanitation, health) facilities by working with local communities
School-initiated engagement	<ul> <li>Regular 1:1 check-in from teachers with students and parents</li> <li>Visit with student families (if needed and possible)</li> <li>Additional engagement by schools with at-risk students (in coordination with parents) 73% of high school dropouts indicated their parents tried to talk them into staying compared to 37% indicating their school tried to talk them into staying according to a 2017 survey in US1)</li> </ul>	After the Ebola outbreak, Liberia provided subsidies to private schools for recovery, in addition to full funding of public schools, enhancing learning infrastructure and re-enrolment
Economic support	<ul> <li>(Conditional) cash transfers and stipends for families/students in need</li> <li>Free school meals / equipment</li> <li>Private school vouchers / subsidies</li> <li>Strengthen enforcement of laws requiring enrolment</li> <li>Strengthen enforcement of bans on child labour</li> </ul>	Davis Joint Unified School District (CA) offers online re-enrolment resources for parents, including an FAQ section in both English and Spanish
Partnerships	<ul> <li>Community partnerships and increased private sector engagement</li> <li>Agricultural incentives where applicable</li> </ul>	During the 2015 floods in Costa Rica, Education Minister asked school directors of more than 400 schools to check in with families to make sure they "don't lose one boy or girl in the classroom"

1. Educationdata.org (2017)

Source: The New York Times, "As School Moves Online, Many Students Stay Logged Out, April 8, 2020; edsurge.com "What Will K-12 Schools Look Like Post-Coronavirus?", April 3, 2020; magnushealth.com, "How K-12 Schools Manage Prospective Students, Enrollment, And Student Health During COVID-19", March 20, 2020; National Center for Education Statistics (2016); Gilroy, Davis, Lancaster, and FLVS websites; UNICEF, educationdata.org, OECD, allhandsandhearts.org

#### McKinsey & Company 25



**Dedicated capacity supporting leadership at each level** - the "nerve center" - to ensure that response is coordinated and carefully monitored, and to enable decision-making



Strong **relationships and partnerships** at policy and operational levels with other relevant government entities (e.g. department of health, local clinical services) and non-government (e.g. transport providers, catering services)



Clear, ongoing communication with important stakeholder groups, especially parents



Effective **data and monitoring systems to track implementation** of health measures within schools, levels of attendance, and overall sentiment among teachers and students



Effective supporting functions, especially IT, finance, and supply chain (for PPE and otherwise)

# **C1** Regional / District Nerve Centers could enable effective monitoring and decision-making during the reopening process

#### Levels and report lines may vary depending on geographies



Source: McKinsey analysis.

### C1 When facing a crisis like COVID-19, Regional / District Nerve Centers can provide clear benefits

Regional / District Nerve Centers provide a centralized, integrated body to help meet the needs at Central / federal and local levels

Benefit		Needs	Role of the Regional / District Nerve Center
Continuous update on national guidelines	FD.	Make sure any updates relating to national guidelines (e.g., new measured / target KPIs) rapidly flow from central to local level	Cascade national guidelines at school level and advise schools on how to facilitate adoption
Close monitoring of compliance to guidelines		Ensure that schools comply with national guidelines and meet target KPIs	Monitor schools reopening processes and frequently update central level (e.g., weekly basis)
Efficient supply distribution/ procurement		Ensure efficient supply distribution / procurement across schools / districts thanks to increased visibility over evolution of stocks / needs	Communicate procurement needs expressed by schools to Central Nerve Center and handle distribution / procurement process for schools
Rapid school shutdown process		Minimize amount of time between communicated, recommended and official school shutdown <sup>1</sup>	Escalate recommendations to Central Nerve Center about potential school closures following reported lack of compliance / appearance of positive case <sup>2</sup> and vice versa
Nation-wide, systematic data gathering		Collect and analyze a wide range of information from schools level (e.g., attendance rate, reported new cases, best sanitary practices) to fuel national dashboard	Provide a centralized data collection and analysis capability for descriptive analytics and projections; such analyses will be the basis of local dashboards and fuel national dashboards

1. NB: assuming decision to shut down a school is made at Central level.

2. NB: assumption made that one positive case within school will lead to a shutdown.

### **C1** Choose and monitor key indicators to track successful implementation

Illustrative dashboard at school level

Example Outpu	<u>t</u>		Gan1	1	2	3	4	1
Compliance to national	Preventive measures	Protective equipment (e.g., masks, gloves, hand sanitizers) daily coverage per school	0.93			 /	•	<ul> <li>Selected school/district</li> <li>National average</li> <li>To monitor successfu</li> </ul>
guidelines		Daily use of protective equipment	1.04		•		•	1 = Needs improvementimplementation a set2 = Emergingof indicators needs
		Number of reported cases of insufficient social distancing (i.e. 6 feet apart) / day	0.86					3 = Establishedto be chosen. These4 = Exceptionalcan be both process-
		Daily frequency of classroom sanitization	0.96					Size of gap <sup>1</sup> oriented (e.g., use of protective equipment
	Diagnostic measures	Diagnostic test / thermometer daily coverage per school	0.96				•	Medium gap (≥.5, <1.0) or outcome-oriented Large gaps (≥1.0, <1.5) (e.g., quantities of
		Daily use of diagnostic equipment	0.86					Very large gaps (≥1.5) protective equipment
		Number of reported cases with temperature above set threshold <sup>4</sup>	0.86					Monitoring of the
	Quarantine measures	Amount of quarantine space available (in m²) / positive case	0.50				•	chosen indicators can be done relative
Minimal attendance rate <sup>2</sup>		Pupils continuous attendance rate <sup>5</sup>	1.11				•	to previous performance,
		Teachers continuous attendance rate <sup>5</sup>	1.00	•				required performance
		Support continuous staff attendance rate <sup>5</sup>	0.89					benchmarking

1. Difference between level of selected district and national average

2. NB: teachers and support staff attendance rates should be sufficiently high for the school to keep operating; pupils attendance rate should be sufficiently high for inequalities in learning to be limited.

4. NB: a relatively high number of cases with temperature could lead to school closure; so could one positive case at school level

5. e.g., no more than 1/2 day of school for pupils / work for staff missed over a week to ensure continuous school operations and learning process.

### Backup

# Archetypes of reopening – examples of countries that are considering doing so (1/2)

Country	Measures
Spain	Spanish schools and universities closed when state of emergency was announced ( <u>source</u> ) Experts advising government officials predict there will be no return before September 2020 ( <u>source</u> ) Rationale is that schools will need to comply with physical distancing norms, which is not possible, and need masks and combined face-to-face and online curriculum ( <u>source</u> )
Italy	Schools will not reopen in May, Italy's education minister Lucia Azzolina said in an interview with an Italian newspaper on 17 April. The comments by the Minister come amid the increasingly likely scenario that Italy's schools will not reopen until September
Estonia	Estonia plans to reopen schools to "smaller groups of children" starting on May 15, with considerable vagueness around how it will be done ( <u>source</u> ) Rationale is that government would like to begin phasing out homeschooling, get children out of their homes with hikes and activities ( <u>source</u> ) Teachers will choose students to be in small groups who need more individual approach or for whom distance learning has not proven effective or through parents input ( <u>source</u> )
United Kingdom	While majority of UK schools are without a solid date for reopening, alternative provision (AP) schools remain openschools for children who have been expelled or are at risk of expulsion (vulnerable and difficult children) (source), including those with an assigned social worker, those on welfare, at risk for domestic violence AP students make up 0.6% of total public school students (source) Rationale is that the school might be the only safe place for these students to go, where they are safe from abuse and can get meals
İsrael	Israel shut down schools and universities, but has reopened special education classes and pre-schools for ~52K students ( <u>source</u> ) Prioritizing special education children to ease pressure off of parents who have had to work with children out of school for a significant amount of time ( <u>source</u> )

# Archetypes of reopening – examples of countries that are considering doing so (2/2)

Country	Measures
Denmark	<ul> <li>Denmark becomes the first country in Europe to relax coronavirus restrictions; children upto age of 11 (5<sup>th</sup> grade) are returning to nursery schools and primary schools (source)</li> <li>Instituting &lt;=10 students per classroom and physical distancing among students</li> <li>Prioritizing younger children both because of parents' inability to return to work without their being cared for, and because of their lack of independence in self-directed learning (source)</li> <li>High schools, universities, and children with at-risk family members will continue remote learning (source)</li> </ul>
Norway	Norway's schools are slated to reopen on Apr 27 for grades 1-4 ( <u>source</u> ) Norway has opened up preschools starting this week Apr 20 after a month long closure ( <u>source</u> ) Prioritizing preschools preschool and younger children because of their relative lack of symptoms from COVID-19, "going to pre-school is safe" ( <u>source</u> )
Germany	German students facing graduation have been allowed to return to sit for exams; other classes remain postponed ( <u>source</u> ) ( <u>source</u> ) ( <u>source</u> ) Schools will begin reopening on 4 May, with special emphasis on graduating classes, the oldest primary school children and students who are expected to take exams Prioritizing student sitting for exams to allow for graduation; students come to school only to take exams, sit in spaced-apart desks
Portugal	Schools were shut down on Mar 12, but a recent plan proposed to reopen 10th, 11th, and 12th grade classes Plan for reopen has now been deferred for review until April 30th ( <u>source</u> ) Prioritizing older children ostensibly for testing and advancement to university purposes, but met with resistance because of vulnerable teacher population ( <u>source</u> )
France	In the first week, only the major sections, CP (6yo – start of primary) and CM2 (10yo - end of primary) will return to class. This will be followed one week later by the 6th, 3rd, 1st and 12th graders. In the third week: all the other students in kindergarten, primary, middle and high school to return to school

### B1 China began...

Not Exhaustive

China has over 200 million K-12 students

As the origin of the outbreak, China both closed and began to reopen its K-12 schools earlier than other countries affected by COVID-19

Several provinces, including Yunnan and Guizhou in southeast China, have reopened secondary and primary schools after ~4 weeks of closure Shanghai to reopen schools gradually between April 27-May 6 depending on any resurgence in COVID-19

 These reflect a combination of measures taken by various K-12 schools / provinces and the set of measures taken at each K-12 school would not necessarily be the same

Source: Xinhua, "Schools begin to reopen in China amid strict measures", March 30, 2020

# ... reopening schools gradually with health & safety measures<sup>1</sup> starting from early March



Physical infrastructure	Separate entrances provided for students of different grades Well-ventilated classrooms Tables with separating partitions in cafeteria
Transportation and food service	Some classes eat in classroom while other dine in cafeteria Canteen tables tagged with serial numbers for each student Tables with separating partitions in cafeteria
Scheduling and staffing	Classes end at different times to avoid group gatherings Same-floor bathrooms used in turns by classes Fewer than 30 students in each classroom to avoid crowdedness
Health and behavioral norms	Students required to keep safe distances in class Simulation by teachers to show processes like walking in, attending classes, handwashing Staff carried out drills, including on taking temperatures, disinfection and mask- wearing Identifying, isolating and hospitalizing pupils with high temperatures Students and teachers are required to wear masks Shelves placed outside classrooms with disinfection sprayers, thermos bottles, cleaning cloths



Not Exhaustive

Japanese Ministry of Education issued a list of guidelines on March 24 for schools to reopen after ~5 weeks of closure

Schools opened in many prefectures starting from April 6 for certain grades

Schools in other prefectures / cities expected to be opened gradually under a state of emergency which gives local authorities extended powers

- Does not apply to all regions as a number of prefectures / cities still have not reopened schools and some that are reopened may also be closed again in the case of an observed resurgence in virus
- 2. These three sets of measures would not necessarily be the same at each reopened K-12 school
- In the context of the measure set up by the Hokkaido Prefectural Government for students to come to school during the closures to check their health conditions as of March 9<sup>th</sup>. Possible to assume that such a measure was maintained post-opening.

Source: Japan Times, "Guidelines on curbing virus issued as Japan's schools set to reopen", March 24, 2020

# ...reopening schools<sup>1,2</sup> in late March under guidelines provided by Ministry of Education

Physical infrastructure	Thorough ventilation
Transportation and food service	Thorough hand-washing before eating lunch
Scheduling and staffing	Students are divided into groups, with different groups going for health checks at different times3
	Students and staff need to avoid conversing with others at close quarters Physical distancing takes place at all times (2 meters), including during morning assembly and recess
	Students and staff need to check their body temperature frequently
Health and	Students and staff need to wear face masks
behavioral norms	If an infection is confirmed, the infected individual and those who were in close contact are to be suspended
	In case of infection, temporary closure of classes or the entire school may also be recommended



#### Not Exhaustive

The Danish Ministry of Education issued a list of guidelines on April 6 for school reopening after ~3 weeks of closure Kindergarten and primary schools reopened across the country on April 15 Schools reopened for students with special needs from all grades (where the individual local councils consider it safe) Matriculating classes in the upper two levels of secondary school also

resumed classes on April 15

1. for children in daycare and primary school.

## ...reopened kindergarten and primary schools after the Easter holiday

Physical nfrastructure	New classroom setups that include desks spaced six feet apart <sup>1</sup> Lessons conducted in gymnasiums <sup>1</sup>
ransportation nd food service	Students have lunch at their individual, spaced out desks
cheduling and taffing	Class size is reduced, and students will attend school on alternating days to facilitate physical distancing Indoor play only allowed between children of pre-defined groups
	Physical distancing takes place at all times (2 meters) including during
	morning assembly and recess
	Employees and students with high-risk family members are not expected to attend classes
lealth and behavioral norms	Schools face strict guidelines on frequently sanitizing surfaces and objects across the school
	Staff is required to educate younger pupils on proper hygiene and ensure they observe safety directives
	If an infection is confirmed, the infected individual and those who were in close contact are to be suspended



Not Exhaustive

The Norwegian government published a set of directives on April 7 to allow school reopening after ~5 weeks of closure

Kindergartens reopened on April 20

If the reopening proves successful, primary schools will gradually begin reopening on April 27 Secondary school reopening will be decided later

# ...is gradually reopening schools under strict safety guidelines

Physical infrastructure	Loose carpets should be removed to facilitate cleaning
Transportation and food service	Children and staff should wash hands before and after meals Children should not share food and drink, bring packed lunches Children should eat in their cohorts In the case of joint dining room, the cohorts should eat at different times Tables and chairs should be washed off after each group
Scheduling and staffing	Cohorts (i.e. fixed groups of children and employees, which are least mixed with other groups) are created Class size is halved, and classes will attend school on alternating days Fewer meetings and gatherings take place
	Physical distancing takes place at all times (2 meters), including during morning assembly and recess
	Schools face strict guidelines on frequently sanitizing surfaces and objects across the school, with some items to be cleaned hourly; failure to comply to these guidelines risks school closure
	Children and adults should wash hands frequently and thoroughly for at least 20 seconds; hands are then wiped with disposable paper towels
Health and	Staff is required to be trained in and educate younger pupils on proper hygiene and ensure they observe safety directives; children cannot bring toys from home
	If an infection is confirmed, the infected individual and those who were in close contact are to be suspended
	In case of infection, temporary closure of classes or the entire school may also be recommended